

### Attachment 1 - Comparison Table

	Element	Advertised Plans (dated 24 March 2004)	VCAT – Amended plans for substituted (20 May 2005)	Summary of changes between advertised plans and VCAT substituted plans
	<b>Use/Floor Areas</b>			
1.	Number of dwellings	<b>245</b> (Including student accommodation)  42- one bedroom dwellings 92- two bedroom dwellings 111- student dwellings	<b>157</b> dwellings  28- one bedroom dwellings 121- two bedroom dwellings 2- three bedroom dwellings 6- two bedroom dwellings with home office	Reduction by <b>88</b> dwellings  no student accommodation  higher proportion of two or more bedroom dwellings
2.	Leasable floor area of supermarket	<b>2669.4</b> square metres (includes shop floor, storage, staff amenities and preparation areas)	<b>2785.8</b> square metres	Increased by <b>116.4</b> square metres
3.	Leasable floor area of retail	<b>2259.2</b> square metres  15 tenancies  including 4 food and drink premises with a maximum capacity 311 seats	<b>1559.8</b> square metres  10 tenancies  including 3 food and drink premises with a maximum capacity of 68 seats	Reduction by <b>699.4</b> square metres  5 less tenancies  no bar  reduction in the number of seats café/ bar by 243
4.	Floor areas of office	<b>2322</b> square metres  9 tenancies	<b>1941.3</b> square metres  9 tenancies	Reduction by <b>380.7</b> square metres
	<b>Car Parking</b>			
5.	Number of spaces	<b>404</b> spaces  144 - basement 2 134- basement 1 126- lower ground	<b>411</b> spaces  174- basement 2 135- basement 1 102- lower ground	Increased <b>7</b> car parking spaces

6.	Area of bicycle parking	Student bicycle parking and store 442 square metres	202.7 square metres	Difficult to compare given area allocated to both store and bicycle parking for advertised plans
	<b>Loading Bay</b>			
7.	Loading bay provisions	2 loading bays with access from Little Oxford Street  large vehicle parallel to Little Oxford Street with length 53 metres, approximately centre of site  Smaller loading bay 84 square metres to the north of the car park access	2 loading bays with access from Little Oxford Street located to the south of the site to accommodate small to medium sized trucks	Deletion of large parallel loading bay  Reduction in the size of trucks which can deliver to site
	<b>Heritage</b>			
8.	Reconstruction of Mountain Design Building	Demolish building	Reconstruction of front facade	
9.	Retention of façade – Coles Original Building	Demolish building	Reconstruction of facade	
10.	Tunnel Retention/Location & Macs Hotel	No reference to tunnel & no mention of Macs hotel	Possible opening to tunnel from car park on lower ground & no mention of Macs Hotel	Plans now reference tunnel
	<b>Built Form</b>			
11.	Building A- number of stories	<b>8</b> stories as viewed from Smith Street  <b>9</b> stories as viewed from Little Oxford Street	<b>7</b> stories as viewed from Smith Street  <b>8</b> stories as viewed from Little Oxford Street	Reduction by 1 level
12.	Building A- Height	Height - <b>27</b> metres viewed from Smith Street  Height - <b>31</b> metres viewed from Little Oxford Street	Height – <b>22.5</b> metres as viewed from Smith Street.  Height – <b>26.3</b> metres as viewed from Little Oxford Street	Reduction in height between 4.5 and 4.7 metres.

13.	Building A- Setback to Smith Street (west title boundary)	First 4 levels built to the Smith Street frontage with the 4 levels above setback 4.5 metres from the same frontage.	First 4 levels built to the Smith Street frontage with the remaining levels setback approximately 8.3 metres from the same frontage.	Increase in the upper level setback by approximately 3.8 metres.
14.	Building A- Setback to Little Oxford Street (east title boundary)	First 4 levels built to the Little Oxford Street frontage, with the remaining levels setback between 2.2 metres and 3.8 metres.	First 3 levels built to the Little Oxford Street frontage with all levels above setback between 5.2 and 19.49 metres.	1 less level built to the Little Oxford Street frontage and a substantial increase in upper level setbacks.
15.	Building A- Setback to south boundary	Built to the southern title boundary for 3 levels with levels above setback between 1.9 metres and 10.4 metres.	First 3 levels built to the southern boundary with all levels above setback between 0 and 5.25 metres.	Decreased setback from the southern boundary.
16.	Building B- Number of stories	<b>6</b> stories as viewed from Smith Street <b>7</b> stories as viewed from Little Oxford Street.	<b>8</b> stories when viewed from Smith Street. <b>10</b> stories when viewed from Little Oxford Street.	Increase of 2 levels.  Increase of 3 levels.
17.	Building B- Height	Height- <b>21</b> metres viewed from Smith Street.  Height- <b>25</b> metres viewed from Little Oxford Street.	Height – <b>25.4</b> metres as viewed from Smith Street.  Height – <b>31.1</b> metres when viewed from Little Oxford Street.	Increase by 4.4 metres as viewed from Smith Street.  Increase by 6.1 metres when viewed from Little Oxford Street.
18.	Building B- Setback from Smith Street (west title boundary)	No setback for the first 4 levels with the levels above setback between 0 and 1.0 metres.	No setback from Smith Street for all levels.	Decrease in setback by 1 metre for the 4 higher levels.
19.	Building B- Setback from Little Oxford Street (east title boundary)	No setback for the first 5 levels, with the two levels above setback between 1.0 and 8.3 metres	No setback for the first 4 levels, with the upper levels setback between 5.2 metres and 21.39 metres.	1 less level built to the Little Oxford Street frontage and upper level setbacks significantly increased.
20.	Building C- Number of stories	<b>8</b> stories when viewed from Smith Street  <b>9</b> stories when viewed from Little	<b>5</b> stories as viewed from Smith Street.  <b>7</b> stories when viewed from Little Oxford Street.	3 less levels when viewed from Smith Street. 2 less levels when viewed from Little Oxford Street.

		Oxford Street		
21.	Building C- Height	<b>27</b> metres when viewed from Smith Street  <b>31</b> metres when viewed from Little Oxford Street	<b>16.5</b> metres as viewed from Smith Street.  <b>21.37</b> metres as viewed from Little Oxford Street.	Reduction in height of 10.5 metres.  Reduction in height of 9.63 metres.
22.	Building C- Setback from Smith Street (west title boundary)	No setback for the first 4 levels and 7.9 metres for the remaining levels above	No setback for the first 4 levels with level above setback 14.9 metres.	Increased setback of upper level by 7 metres.
23.	Building C- Setback from Little Oxford Street (east title boundary)	No setback for the first 4 levels, and 3.4 metres for the remaining levels above	No setback for the first 4 levels with the levels above estimated to be setback between 5.2 and 8.36 metres.	Increased upper level setback of between 1.8 and 4.9 metres.
24.	Building C- Setback from the northern title boundary	No setback for the first 3 levels, between 0 and 4.8 metres for the next level, and then 4.8 metres for the next 5 levels above.	No setback for the first 3 levels with levels above setback between 0 and 12 metres.	Increased upper level setback of approximately 7.2 metres.
25.	Distance between Buildings A and B	Minimum distance is 19.9 metres	Minimum distance is 22.85 metres.	An increase in the separation distance of 2.9 metres.
26.	Distance between Buildings B and C	Minimal distance of 14.8 metres	Minimum distance of 14.2 metres.	Decrease in the separation distance of 600mm.
27.	Central landscaped courtyard provided at second level between buildings	Between Building A & B- 430.2 square metres.  Between Building B & C- 584 square metres.	Between Buildings A & B – 459 square metres.  Between Buildings B & C - 253.1 square metres.	An increase of 28.8 square metres.  A decrease of 330.9 square metres.
28.	Height of facade along Smith Street	Between 10 & 15 metres	Between 10 & 15 metres (other than Building B and the reconstructed Mountain Design building)	Generally the same (other than Building B)
29.	Height of facade along Little Oxford	Between 10 & 15 metres	Generally 11.8 metres.	Generally the same.

30.	Façade appearance when viewed from Smith Street	Incorporated wide verandah element across substantial section of façade, over the footpath and shop/commercial frontages.	Incorporates the same verandah element and shop/commercial frontages.	Very similar with exception of restored/retained heritage building frontages.
31.	Façade appearance when viewed from Little Oxford Street	Incorporated large sliding door elements associated with the large loading bay, suspended landscaping and office and car park frontages/entrances.	Two smaller loading bay entrances, commercial and dwelling frontages.	Loss of large loading bay and replacement with east facing dwellings.